RAJYA SABHA

Thursday, the 15th December, 1994/ 24th Agrahayana, 1916 (Saka)

The House met at eleven of the clock, Mr. Chairman in the Chair.

RE. SUSPENSION OF QUESTION HOUR

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Sir, I gave notice for suspension of the Question Hour. May I mention why I have notice.

श्री जनेश्वर मिश्र : क्वैश्चन आवर का कोई सवाल ही नहीं है । ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय : हमनें प्रश्न काल को निलम्बित करनें का नोटिस दिया है । ..(**व्यवधान**)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Sir, we should be allowed one by one to make submissions. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री संघ प्रिय गौतम : एक कैबिनेट मंत्री ने पद त्याग दिया है। (**व्यवधान**)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Will you sit down? I will respond to it. Kindly it down. I will respond to it. ... (*Interruptions*) Please sit down if you want me to respond to it. ...(*Interruptions*)

Please sit down.

SYED SIBTEY RAZI: Sir, my submission is that the questions should be taken up. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down.

SHRI MOHAMMED AFZAL *alias* MEEM AFZAL: The Prime Minister is here. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I allow Mr. Jaipal Reddy to speak for one minute. ...(*Interruptions*)

Kindly take your seat. I have allowed him to speak for a minute. ... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Mr. Chairman, fortuitously—I do not know whether it is fortunately—the Prime Minister is also in the House. I tabled a notice for suspension of the Question Hour because of the context in which Mr. A. K. Antony has resigned from the Council of Ministers. It is not the resignation alone which is important, but the ground on which the resignation has been submitted is also important. The sugar scandal has been rocking this House for the last three sessions, and the Gian Prakash Committee Report ...(*Interruptions*)

SYED SIBTEY RAZI: If they want to suspend the Question Hour, they have no right to make the statement. They can directly move for suspension of the Question Hour. They cannot make such undersirable statements. There is no rule under which they can do so. ...(*Interruptions*)

विपक्ष के नेता (श्री सिकन्दर बख्त) : सदर साहब, यह क्या हो रहा है ? आपनें इन्हें इजाजत दी है। .(**व्यवधान**)

شری سکندر بخت: صدر صاحب۔ یہ کیا ہو رہا ہے، آپ نے انہیں اجازت دی ہے... مداخلت...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Let me be heard. The Chairman has permitted me.

SYED SIBTEY RAZI: They cannot make statements like these. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him say something. I will respond to him. ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Mr. A. K. Antony is a very honourable man. He has resigned rightly because he has no business to continue as Minister in thiis entirely dishonourable Ministry. And the Prime Minister... (*Interruptions*)

Transliteration in Arabic Script.

SYED SIBTEY RAZI: This is not related to the Question Hour. If they want to suspend the Question Hour, there is a set procedure. ....(*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: I plead with you to suspend the Question Hour.

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : ...(**व्यवधान**)..

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will like to respond to it. ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT: Please let Mr. Mathur speak. ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: I have submitted notice. (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: One minute ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: I should be given one minute, Sir. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will give. Please sit diwn.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF CHEMICALS AND FERTILIZERS (SHRI EDUARDO FALEIRO): Mr. Chairman, may I know under which rule are the hon. Members speaking during the Question Hour?

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA: Under rule 267. ...(*Interruption*)

SHRI EDUARDO FALEIRO: May I request that aspersions cast should be expunged from the record? (*Interruptions*) Whatever aspersions are cast and whatever are unparliamentary, please look into the record and expunge them. (*Interruptions*)

श्री जनेश्वर मिश्र : महोदय, किस रूल के तहत क्वश्चिन ऑवर में इस तरह की बात उठाई जा रही है..... (**व्यवधान**) सच तो यह है कि ये भी मंत्री हैं। इनके एक साथी ने इस्तीफा दिया है जिनके बारे में यह तस्वीर है कि बहुत ईमानदार मंत्री हैं। कई मंत्रियों के बारे में खबर छप गई है कि इस्तीफा दे रहे हैं...(व्यवधान) सरकार की विश्वसनीयता समाप्त हो गई है.... (व्यवधान) फिर सरकार के कई मंत्री इस्तीफा देने वाले हैं, इस पर बहस यहां होनी चाहिए। प्रोसीजर से हिंदुस्तान का संविधान बड़ा है। हिंदुस्तान का संविधान खतरे में पड़ गया है। नरसिंह राव की सरकार के कई मंत्री इस्तीफा दे रहे हैं। एक मंत्री इस्तीफा दे चुका है। कोई भरोसा नहीं रह गया है...(**व्यवधान**) यह वैधानिक सवाल है...(**व्यवधान**) हिंदुस्तान के संविधान का हवाला दे करके मैं आपसे प्रार्थना करता हूं कि इस पर बहस कराई जाए...(**व्यवधान**)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have heard you. I will give a minute to Mr. Mathur. (*Interruptions*)

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : महोदय, मेरी मांग है कि प्रश्नकाल स्थगित किया जाये...(**व्यवधान**)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Will you please sit down?

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT: Please give Mr. Mathur time. He has also given a notice. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI AJIT P. K. JOGI: Is it regarding suspension of the Question Hour, Sir? (*Interruptions*) He cannot speak on any other subject except the Question Hour until you suspend the Question Hour. (*Interruptions*)

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : इस्तीफे का सवाल नहीं है (**व्यवधान**) मैं मांग करता हूं कि क्वश्चिन - ऑवर

सस्पैंड किया जाए। मेरी मांग है कि क्वश्चिन-आँवर सस्पैंड करके एक क्राईसिस जो खड़ा हुआ है, उसको डिस्क्स किया जाये ...(**व्यवधान**) श्रीमन् मैं मानता हूं कि प्रश्नकाल बहुत महत्वपूर्ण है लेकिन आज एक विशेष स्थिति खड़ी हुई है जो सारे देश को आन्दोलित कर रही है। यदि मामूली तौर से सहयोगी सांसद मंत्री ने इस्तीफा दिया होता तो सामान्य स्थिति होती। सामान्य स्थिति में किसी का त्यागपत्र महत्व नहीं रखता। परन्तु आज सारे देश के सामने सवाल यह है कि यह सरकार बनी रह सकेगी या नहीं रह सकेगी। इस क्राईसिस पर विचार करने के लिये प्रश्नकाल समाप्त किया जाना चाहिये और जो क्राइसिस खड़ा हुआ है, उस क्राईसिस पर हम बहस करें। प्रधान मंत्री महोदय यहां मौजूद हैं.. (**व्यवधान**)... सरकार को रिजाइन करना होगा। वह खड़े होकर बतायें... (**व्यवधान**) यह सवाल सारे देश के सामने है। वह बतायें कि उनकी सरकार है कि नहीं है। सरकार नहीं है देश में, इसीलिये हमको इस स्थिति पर बहस करने की इजाजत दी जानी चाहिये।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Order, please.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Sir, I request you to give me one minute. (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have given your case. You please sit down. (*Interruptions*) Will you please keep quiet? (*Interruptions*) I would like hon. Members .. (*Interruptions*) Will you kindly listen to me? Four or five hon. Members have given me notice asking for the suspension of the Question Hour because they want to discuss the resignation of the Minister, Mr. Anthony. I do not think this is a subject which can be raised in the Question Hour and I also do not think that it is something which should lead to the suspension of the Question Hour. If that subject is to be discussed at some other time in some other legitimate Parliamentary method. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT: Kindly let me speak for half a minute. During the Question Hour... (*Interruptions*) Is there a Government? There is no Government. (*Interruptions*) The Government does not exist. (*Interruptions*) The Government does not exist .... (*Interruptions*) ...The Government does not exist... (*Interruptions*)... The Government does not exist. Who will answer the question? (*Interruptions*) ...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Well, if you allow the Question Hour to go on, you would see whether the questions will be answered or not. They will answer it. ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT: Who will answer? ... (*Interruptions*)

There is no Government.

MR CHAIRMAN: I will call out the question. I would be answered. Now, I would like to take up the Question Hour. ... (*Interruptions*)... During the Question Hour, there should not be any interruption. You have to seek other methods and opportunities of ventilating your views. So, I would like to call Q. No. 121. Mr. Dipankar Mukherjee. ....(*Interruptions*)...

श्री कैलाश नारायण सारंग : अब तो अन्तरात्मा की आवाज को पहचानों... (**व्यवधान**)....

श्री अजीत जोगी : चारे खाने वित्त किया मध्य प्रदेश में... (व्यवधान)...

श्री कैलाश नारायण सारंग : कर्नाटक में क्या हुआ आन्ध्र में क्या हुआ... ... (**व्यवधान**)...

ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

Revival of Braithwaite and Company Ltd.

*121. SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE:†

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU:

Will the PRIME MINISTER be pleased to state:

(a) whether, in the BIFR hearing